



REL Appalachia Ask A REL Response

Discipline, Educator Effectiveness
August 2019

Question:

What classroom management strategies, particularly for middle and high school teachers, are supported by evidence of effectiveness?

Response:

Thank you for your request to our REL Reference Desk regarding evidence-based information about classroom management strategies. Ask A REL is a collaborative reference desk service provided by the 10 Regional Educational Laboratories (RELs) that, by design, functions much in the same way as a technical reference library. Ask A REL provides references, referrals, and brief responses in the form of citations in response to questions about available education research.

Following an established REL Appalachia research protocol, we searched for peer-reviewed articles and other research reports on classroom management strategies supported by evidence of effectiveness. We focused on identifying resources that specifically addressed classroom management strategies for middle and high school teachers, although we also included some important reviews of the research on classroom management strategies in elementary school classrooms. The sources included ERIC and other federally funded databases and organizations, research institutions, academic research databases, and general Internet search engines. For more details, please see the methods section at the end of this document.

The research team did not evaluate the quality of the resources provided in this response; we offer them only for your reference. Also, the search included the most commonly used research databases and search engines to produce the references presented here, but the references are not necessarily comprehensive, and other relevant references and resources may exist. References are listed in alphabetical order, not necessarily in order of relevance.

References

Epstein, M., Atkins, M., Cullinan, D., Kutash, K., & Weaver, R. (2008). *Reducing behavior problems in the elementary school classroom: A practice guide* (NCEE #2008-012). Washington, DC: National Center for Education Evaluation and Regional Assistance, Institute

of Education Sciences, U.S. Department of Education. Retrieved from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED502720>

From the abstract: “This guide is intended to help elementary school educators as well as school and district administrators develop and implement effective prevention and intervention strategies that promote positive student behavior. The guide includes five recommendations and indicates the quality of the evidence that supports them: (1) Identify the specifics of the problem behavior and the conditions that prompt and reinforce it; (2) Modify the classroom learning environment to decrease problem behavior; (3) Teach and reinforce new skills to increase appropriate behavior and preserve a positive classroom climate; (4) Draw on relationships with professional colleagues and students’ families for continued guidance and support; and (5) Assess whether schoolwide behavior problems warrant adopting schoolwide strategies or programs and, if so, implement ones shown to reduce negative and foster positive interactions. Suggested strategies for carrying out each recommendation are included, identifying potential roadblocks to implementation that may be encountered and possible circumventions. Technical details about the studies that support the recommendations are provided.”

Larson, K. E., Pas, E. T., Bradshaw, C. P., Rosenberg, M. S., & Day-Vines, N. L. (2018). Examining how proactive management and culturally responsive teaching relate to student behavior: Implications for measurement and practice. *School Psychology Review, 47*(2), 152–166. Retrieved from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1182041>

From the abstract: “The discipline gap between White students and African American students has increased demand for teacher training in culturally responsive and behavior management practices. Extant research, however, is inconclusive about how culturally responsive teaching practices relate to student behavior or how to assess using such practices in the classroom. Identifying proactive behavior management and culturally responsive teaching practices that are associated with positive student behavior may inform teacher training and bolster efforts to reduce disparities in behavioral and academic performance. The current study examined the association between student behaviors and the observed use of and teacher self-reported efficacy in using culturally responsive teaching and proactive behavior management practices. Data were collected from 274 teachers in 18 schools. Structural equation modeling indicated a statistically significant association between observations of culturally responsive teaching and proactive behavior management practices, with observed positive student behaviors in classrooms. Implications for measurement and practice are discussed.”

Oliver, R. M., Wehby, J. H., & Reschly, D. J. (2011). Teacher classroom management practices: Effects on disruptive or aggressive student behavior. *Campbell Systemic Reviews, 4*. Abstract retrieved from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED519160>; full text available at https://campbellcollaboration.org/media/k2/attachments/Oliver_Classroom_Management_Review.pdf

From the abstract: “Despite the large research base grounded in behavioral theory for strategies to increase appropriate behavior and prevent or decrease inappropriate behavior

in the classroom, a systematic review of multi-component universal classroom management research is necessary to establish the effects of teachers' universal classroom management approaches. This review examines the effects of teachers' universal classroom management practices in reducing disruptive, aggressive, and inappropriate behaviors. The specific research questions addressed are: Do teachers' universal classroom management practices reduce problem behavior in classrooms with students in kindergarten through grade 12? What components make up the most effective and efficient classroom management programs? These questions were addressed through a systematic review of the classroom management literature and a meta-analysis to calculate the magnitude of the effects of classroom management on disruptive or aggressive student behavior. In addition, limitations found in this body of research will be highlighted."

Simonsen, B., Fairbanks, S., Briesch, A., Myers, D., & Sugai, G. (2008). Evidence-based practices in classroom management: Considerations for research to practice. *Education and Treatment of Children, 31*(3), 351–380. Abstract retrieved from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ798223>; full text available at https://dropoutprevention.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/Simonsen_Fairbanks_Briesch_Myers_Sugai_2008.pdf

From the abstract: "Classroom management is a critical skill area. Teachers should be trained and supported in implementing practices that are likely to be successful; that is, practices that are backed by evidence. The purpose of this paper is to describe the outcomes of a systematic literature search conducted to identify evidence-based classroom management practices. Although the need for additional research exists, 20 practices, in general, were identified as having sufficient evidence to be considered for classroom adoption. Considerations for incorporating these practices are suggested, and a self-assessment tool is proposed as means of evaluating and enhancing use of these practices. Suggestions for future research are also presented."

Skiba, R., Ormiston, H., Martinez, S., & Cummings, J. (2016). Teaching the social curriculum: Classroom management as behavioral instruction. *Theory Into Practice, 55*(2), 120–128. Abstract retrieved from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1096852>; full text available at <http://jan.ucc.nau.edu/~coesyl-p/principle7-article1.pdf>

From the abstract: "Psychological science has identified positive classroom management and climate building strategies as a key element in developing and maintaining effective learning environments. In this article, we review the literature that has identified effective strategies that build classroom climates to maximize student learning and minimize disruption. In general, these strategies indicate a shift away from reactive and punitive approaches towards an emphasis on instructional and preventive approaches, including setting clear expectations, appropriate curriculum to increase student engagement, positive acknowledgment, and building relationships between students and teachers. Emerging research has also begun to identify features of culturally responsive classroom management that can engage and build relationships for a diverse student population."

Additional Ask A REL Responses to Consult

Ask A REL Midwest at American Institutes for Research. (2017). *What does the research say about differentiated or disproportionate behavioral interventions?* Retrieved from https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/edlabs/regions/midwest/askarel/2017/RDR004_BI_Response_April.aspx

Ask A REL Midwest at American Institutes for Research. (2018). *What does the research say about the relationship of visual, public behavior management displays (e.g., clip charts or behavior management charts) and student well-being (e.g., psychological impact of public shaming or praise)?* Retrieved from <https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/edlabs/regions/midwest/askarel/2018/behavior-management-clip-charts.aspx>

Ask A REL Northeast & Islands at Educational Development Center. (2017). *What is the research on the effects of Conscious Discipline on academics and/or behavior of students in preK through grade 3?* Retrieved from <https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/edlabs/regions/northeast/AskAREL/Response/23>

Ask A REL Northwest at Education Northwest. (2018). *What does the research say about effective strategies for classroom management and discipline?* Retrieved from <https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/edlabs/regions/northwest/askarel/classroom-management.asp>

Ask A REL Southeast at Florida State University. (2017). *What research has been conducted on classroom management in terms of student emotional responses?* Retrieved from https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/edlabs/regions/southeast/aar/ee_02-2017.asp

Additional Organizations to Consult

Center for Teaching Quality (CTQ): <http://www.teachingquality.org/>

From the website: “For 20 years, CTQ has led efforts to improve public education, drawing from the expertise and insights of experienced educators. We have worked with thousands of teachers, administrators, and system leaders nationwide, listening to and learning from their experiences, then collaborating with them to create solutions to make public schools better.”

Center on Great Teachers and Leaders at American Institutes for Research:
<http://www.gtlcenter.org/>

From the website: “The Center on Great Teachers and Leaders (GTL Center) is dedicated to supporting state education leaders in their efforts to grow, respect, and retain great teachers and leaders for all students. The GTL Center continues the work of the National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality (TQ Center) and expands its focus to provide technical assistance and online resources designed to build systems that:

- Support the implementation of college and career standards.

- Ensure the equitable access of effective teachers and leaders.
- Recruit, retain, reward, and support effective educators.
- Develop coherent human capital management systems.
- Create safe academic environments that increase student learning through positive behavior management and appropriate discipline.
- Use data to guide professional development and improve instruction.”

Methods

Keywords and Search Strings

The following keywords and search strings were used to search the reference databases and other sources:

- (“Classroom management” OR “student behavior”) AND (interven* OR practice OR strateg*)
- (“Classroom management” OR “student behavior”) AND (interven* OR practice OR strateg*) AND (effect OR impact) AND (“middle school” OR “high school” OR secondary)

Databases and Resources

We searched ERIC, a free online library of more than 1.6 million citations of education research sponsored by the Institute of Education Sciences (IES), for relevant resources. Additionally, we searched the academic database ProQuest, Google Scholar, and the commercial search engine Google.

Reference Search and Selection Criteria

In reviewing resources, Reference Desk researchers consider—among other things—these four factors:

- Date of the publication: Searches cover information available within the last ten years, except in the case of nationally known seminal resources.
- Reference sources: IES, nationally funded, and certain other vetted sources known for strict attention to research protocols receive highest priority. Applicable resources must be publicly available online and in English.
- Methodology: The following methodological priorities/considerations guide the review and selection of the references: (a) study types—randomized controlled trials, quasi experiments, surveys, descriptive data analyses, literature reviews, policy briefs, etc., generally in this order; (b) target population, samples (representativeness of the target population, sample size, volunteered or randomly selected), study duration, etc.; (c) limitations, generalizability of the findings and conclusions, etc.
- Existing knowledge base: Vetted resources (e.g., peer-reviewed research journals) are the primary focus, but the research base is occasionally slim or nonexistent. In those cases, the best resources available may include, for example, reports, white papers,

guides, reviews in non-peer-reviewed journals, newspaper articles, interviews with content specialists, and organization websites.

Resources included in this document were last accessed on July 25, 2019. URLs, descriptions, and content included here were current at that time.

This memorandum is one in a series of quick-turnaround responses to specific questions posed by education stakeholders in the Appalachia region (Kentucky, Tennessee, Virginia, and West Virginia), which is served by the Regional Educational Laboratory Appalachia (REL AP) at SRI International. This Ask A REL response was developed by REL AP under Contract ED-IES-17-C-0004 from the U.S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, administered by SRI International. The content does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of IES or the U.S. Department of Education, nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the U.S. government.