## What is Culturally Sustaining Pedagogy?

Culturally sustaining pedagogy is a strengths-based instructional approach that centers and sustains the cultural and linguistic identities, experiences, and ways of knowing of diverse students, families/caregivers, and communities. This approach recognizes that culture is a dynamic set of values, beliefs, and practices that varies across students' social identities (related to gender, sexuality, disability, socioeconomic status, geographical location, and time period). Educators adopt culturally sustaining pedagogies so that culturally and linguistically diverse students might leave schools with a sense of pride in themselves, a sense that they belong at school and have access to meaningful postsecondary pathways.<sup>2, 3</sup>

Culturally sustaining pedagogies are inherently dynamic approaches. They meaningfully center the communities and identities of students by affirming and uplifting their perceptions and experiences and incorporating their expertise into classroom practices. Therefore, what is culturally sustaining will look different across communities and contexts. Despite this variance, four common elements tend to emerge across teachers implementing culturally sustaining pedagogical practices.<sup>4</sup>

## Including student and intergenerational community agency and input.

### **Example Practice:**

Recognize that families/caregivers and community members are experts in their own right. Learn about important cultural practices from families/caregivers that might be incorporated into classroom practices (for example, how to make tamales or weave mats). Partner with, not just involve, families/caregivers and communities in classroom planning and goal-setting. 6, 7, 8

**Centering** dynamic communities and their languages, practices, and knowledge.

#### **Example Practice:**

Learn about students' racial, ethnic, cultural, and linguistic backgrounds and their communities. Incorporate knowledge students gain from their families and communities and rich cultural and linguistic ways of being into instruction. Doing so helps to expand and sustain students' ways of being and promotes their conceptual understanding, language competence, and mastery of analytical practices.<sup>5</sup>



### **Example Practice:**

Develop reciprocal relationships with Indigenous communities through cross-cultural learning settings. This might include centering the values, knowledge, sovereignty, and expertise of Indigenous students, families/caregivers, communities, and educators in the curriculum or implementing feedback cycles with Indigenous communities about educational goals across the home and school. Lesson topics can include environmental sustainability and vulnerability, sociopolitical history and citizenship, or ethnomathematics.9, 10, 11

### **Providing structured** opportunities to contend with internalized oppressions.

### **Example Practice:**

Create opportunities for students to learn about the histories of their own and other students' cultures. Support students in using their voices to raise awareness about or push back against oppressive systems and structures in culturally relevant ways that simultaneously foster a critical awareness of the world, move beyond damaging narratives, and highlight the joy and resilience of communities of color (for example, Hip-Hop Pedagogy).12







Adopting or incorporating culturally sustaining pedagogy can help educators affirm students' identities and engage students, families/caregivers, and communities in determining their own agentic goals and outcomes for learning. This pedagogical approach has also been shown to be positively correlated with educational outcomes, such as student engagement, attendance, and performance on traditional academic indicators (such as grades and test scores). 13, 14, 15

## Culturally sustaining pedagogy is best supported through a systemwide approach. 16, 17, 18, 19, 20



# Culturally Sustaining Classrooms

- Educators who explore their own beliefs and cultural identities, highlight their students' experiences, leverage students' strengths to support their learning, and provide opportunities to critically reflect on implicit bias.
- Safe, inclusive, and sustaining learning environments.
- Positive teacher-student and peer relationships.
- Curriculum and materials reflect students' experiences.



<u>California's Presentation on</u> <u>Leveraging the Assets of Student</u> <u>Diversity<sup>21</sup></u>



National Center on Safe Supportive Learning Environments' Cultural & Linguistic Competence Topic Brief<sup>22</sup>



# Culturally Sustaining Schools

- Supportive school leadership that authentically partners with families/caregivers and community members.
- A safe and inclusive school culture and climate that address bias-related incidents constructively and celebrate the strengths of diverse student backgrounds.
- High-quality, culturally sustaining curricula.



Intercultural Development
Research Association's Four
Leverage Points for Culturally
Sustaining Practices<sup>23</sup>



Rhode Island's High Quality
Curriculum Materials (HQCM)
Review Tools for Culturally
Responsive & Sustaining Education<sup>24</sup>



Midwest and Plains Equity
Assistance Center's Equity Dispatch
Issue on Universal Design for
Learning and Culturally Sustaining
Pedagogy<sup>25</sup>



# **Culturally Sustaining Education Agencies**

- Assessment systems that measure multiple ways of learning, center students' identity and experiences, and focus on issues and problems relevant to students' lives.
- Supportive district or state leadership that champions culturally sustaining education initiatives and hires and retains teachers of color and teachers who are versed in culturally sustaining pedagogy.
- Policies that ensure all students have access to a culturally and linguistically sustaining and equitable education.
- Teaching and learning standards that allow schools and communities to examine the extent to which they are supporting the educational and cultural well-being of students.



New York's Culturally Responsive-Sustaining Education Framework<sup>26</sup>



Alaska Standards for Culturally Responsive Schools<sup>27</sup>



Equity Assistance Center-South's
Webinar on Culturally Responsive and
Sustaining Practices at the LEA Level<sup>28</sup>

### References

- 1. Alim, H. S., Paris, D., & Wong, C. P. (2020). Culturally sustaining pedagogies: A critical framework for centering communities. In N. S. Nasir, C. D. Lee, R. Pea, & M. Mckinney de Royston (Eds.), Handbook of the cultural foundations of learning (pp. 261–276). Routledge.
- 2. Lee, T. S., & McCarty, T. L. (2017). Upholding Indigenous education sovereignty through critical culturally sustaining/revitalizing pedagogy. In D. Paris & H. S. Alim (Eds.), Culturally sustaining pedagogies: Teaching and learning for justice in a changing world, (pp. 61–82). Teachers College Press.
- 3. Paris, D., & Alim, H. S. (Eds.). (2017). Culturally sustaining pedagogies: Teaching and learning for justice in a changing world. Teachers College Press.
- 4. Alim, H. S., Paris, D., & Wong, C. P. (2020). Culturally sustaining pedagogies: A critical framework for centering communities. In N. S. Nasir, C. D. Lee, R. Pea, & M. Mckinney de Royston (Eds.), Handbook of the cultural foundations of learning (pp. 261–276). Routledge.
- 5. Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (n.d.). ESL best practices quick reference guide: Racial equity and social justice. https://www.doe.mass.edu/ele/esl-toolkit/tools-resources/best-practices/racial-equity-social-justice.docx
- 6. Khalifa, M. A., Gooden, M. A., & Davis, J. E. (2016). Culturally responsive school leadership: A synthesis of the literature. Review of Educational Research, 86(4), 1272-1311.
- 7. New York State Education Department. (2019). Topic brief: Building on emergent multilingual learners' language practices in pre-school and kindergarten programs. http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/programs/bilingual-ed/topic-brief-emergent-mlls-a.pdf.
- 8. Holquist, S., & Porter, T. (2020). Culturally responsive leading and learning: Addressing equity through student and family voice. U.S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Education Evaluation and Regional Assistance, Regional Educational Laboratory Pacific. https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/rel/Products/Region/pacific/Blog/70073
- 9. Dey, D. (2020). Supporting Pacific Island communities through place-based education. U.S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Education Evaluation and Regional Assistance, Regional Educational Laboratory Pacific. https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/rel/Products/Region/pacific/Blog/70066
- 10. Kaomea, J. (2011). Hawaiian math for a sustainable future: Envisioning a conceptual framework for rigorous and culturally relevant 21 st-Century elementary mathematics education. In C. C. Nicol, J. Archibald, F. Glanfield, A. J. S. Dawson, & S. Dawson (Eds.), Living culturally responsive mathematics education with/in Indigenous communities. Kamehameha Publishing.
- 11. Fullerton, S. (2021). Indigenous education: Land as text. BU Journal of Graduate Studies in Education, 13, 43-46.
- 12. Clayton-Taylor, N. (2018). Hip-hop into learning. Kentucky Teacher. https://www.kentuckyteacher.org/leadership/guest-columns/2018/08/hip-hop-into-learning/
- 13. At the time this infographic was created, there had been no studies with the keywords, "culturally sustaining pedagogy," "culturally sustaining education," "place-based education," place-based pedagogy," "heritage revitalization," "Indigenous education," "language revitalization," "hip-hop pedagogy," or "abolitionist teaching" reviewed by the What Works Clearinghouse.
- 14. Paris, D., & Alim, H. S. (Eds.). (2017). Culturally sustaining pedagogies: Teaching and learning for justice in a changing world. Teachers College Press.
- 15. New York State Education Department (2019). Topic brief: Building on emergent multilingual learners' language practices in pre-school and kindergarten programs. http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/programs/bilingual-ed/topic-brief-emergent-mlls-a.pdf.
- 16. Alaska Native Knowledge Network (n.d.). Alaska standards for culturally responsive schools. University of Alaska Fairbanks. https://www.uaf.edu/ankn/publications/guides/alaska-standards-for-cult/
- 17. Connecticut State Department of Education (n.d). Creating a culturally sustaining classroom through building relationships and intentional instructional practices. https://portal.ct.gov/sde/-/media/SDE/NetStat/NetStat\_5\_14\_21/Relationships\_Culturally\_Sustaining\_Classrooms.pdf.
- 18. Johnson, P., & Bojorquez, H. (2022, April). Four leverage points for culturally sustaining practices. Intercultural Development Research Association. https://www.idra.org/resource-center/four-leverage-points-for-culturally-sustaining-practices/
- 19. Porter, L., & Umansky, I. (2021). Exploring policy and practice for Alaska native English learner students. U.S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Education Evaluation and Regional Assistance, Regional Educational Laboratory Northwest. https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/rel/Products/Region/northwest/Blog/60177
- 20. Vermont Agency of Education. (2021). Essential components for ensuring local comprehensive assessment systems are culturally relevant and equitable. https://education.vermont.gov/sites/aoe/files/documents/edu-essential-components-for-ensuring-lcas-are-culturally-relevant-and-equitable.pdf.
- 21. California Department of Education. (2020). Collaborative Learning with 21st Century Learning Environments: Leveraging the Assets of Student Diversity. https://www.cde.ca.gov/ls/fa/sf/documents/centurylearningenvironments.pdf.
- 22. National Center on Safe Supportive Learning Environments. (2023). Cultural & linguistic competence. https://safesupportivelearning.ed.gov/topic-research/engagement/cultural-linguistic-competence
- 23. Johnson, P., & Bojorquez, H. (2022, April). Four leverage points for culturally sustaining practices. IDRA Newsletter. https://www.idra.org/resource-center/four-leverage-points-for-culturally-sustaining-practices/
- 24. Rhode Island Department of Education. (n.d.) Curriculum: High-quality curriculum materials review tools. https://ride.ri.gov/instruction-assessment/curriculum
- 25. Midwest & Plains Equity Assistance Center. (2020). Shifting from Surveillance and Control in Virtual Learning Environments: Utilizing Principles of Universal Design for Learning & Culturally Sustaining Pedagogy. https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED624600.pdf.
- 26. New York State Education Department. (n.d.). Culturally responsive-sustaining education-framework. http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/programs/crs/culturally-responsive-sustaining-education-framework.pdf.
- 27. Alaska Native Knowledge Network. (n.d.). Alaska standards for culturally responsive schools. University of Alaska Fairbanks. https://www.uaf.edu/ankn/publications/guides/alaska-standards-for-cult/
- 28. Equity Assistance Center-South. (2017). Cultivating equity-oriented educators: What SEAs can do to promote culturally responsive and sustaining practices at the LEA Level. [Webinar]. Intercultural Development Research Association. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dG6gXJybyEw

### A Resource from the National Center for Education Evaluation and Regional Assistance

This infographic builds on previous work on culturally relevant and culturally sustaining education, as well as related work that includes, but is not limited to, language revitalization and Indigenous education. The infographic was created by REL Pacific in collaboration with representatives from each of the RELs who participate in a working group on culturally sustaining pedagogy.



This infographic was prepared under Contract # 91990022C0010 by Regional Educational Laboratory (REL) Pacific, administered by McREL International. The content does not necessarily reflect the views or policies of IES or the U.S. Department of Education, nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the U.S. Government.

REL Pacific serves educators in American Samoa, the Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands, the Federated States of Micronesia, Guam, Hawai'i, the Republic of the Marshall Islands, and the Republic of Palau. Working in partnership with schools, districts, state departments of education, and others, REL Pacific promotes the use of data and research to improve academic outcomes for students. For more information, please visit <a href="https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/rel/region/pacific">https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/rel/region/pacific</a>.